

City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 19, 2007 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street
COMMISSION MEMBERS: WILLIAM LA VOIE, Chair – Absent

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Absent ALEX PUJO, *Vice-Chair* – Present

ROBERT ADAMS – Present

LOUISE BOUCHER – Present

LOUISE BOUCHER – Present

KEN CURTIS – Present

 $STEVE\ HAUSZ-Absent$

FERMINA MURRAY – Present

 $SUSETTE\ NAYLOR-Present$

DONALD SHARPE - Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON – Absent PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor- Present until 1:50 p.m. and returned at 3:39 p.m.

JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian- Present SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I-PresentI AUDREY WILK, Commission Secretary -Present

Website: www.SantaBarbartaCa.gov

1:30 P.M.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing) Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Plans - floor, roof, etc. Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: Plans - floor, roof, etc. Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.
- ** AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT: In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on September 14, 2007, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:31):

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Dale Francisco, observed that a tree and fountain were removed at El Paseo's Wine Cask restaurant. He claims that no enforcement has been made so far and that these types of violations need to be cited immediately.

John Woodward, a former chair of the Historic Landmarks Commission and local resident, feels that the city needs to be proactive in enforcing the ordinance. If not, he feels this will lead to the loss of other landmarks throughout the rest of the city.

Kellam De Forrest, a local resident, feels that the Historic Structures and sites in Santa Barbara need to be preserved and feels that it is the Commission's job to enforce these ordinances. Additionally, he would like the red and yellow chairs at the Wine Cask restaurant removed from the street frontage.

Mr. Limón responded that current practice is not to issue immediate fines and that the city gives warnings and then levies fines. He asked for recommendations from the Commissioners about how they would like to amend the city's fine enforcement policies. This enforcement issue will be discussed at the next meeting.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 05, 2007.

The approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 5, 2007, was postponed.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Alex Pujo.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
 - 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Chair LaVoie and Commissioner Hausz will be absent today.
 - b) The project at 325 E. Canon Perdido Street, which was continued two weeks to today's meeting, has been postponed for another two weeks at the applicant's request.
 - c) The project at 125 Rametto Road, which was postponed to today's meeting, has been indefinitely continued at the applicant's request. (Neither item appears on the agenda.)
- E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Ms. Boucher commented on her concern about the quality of the signs and lack of permits in the city.

DISCUSSION ITEM

(1:49)

Presentation by Planning Division staff on the Plan Santa Barbara - Community Input Summary Report.

Present: Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Bettie Weiss, City Planner, presented a preliminary summary report of Phase I of the Plan Santa Barbara report and commented on its main purposes and outcomes by looking at what has happened in the last 20 years and what the Staff hopes to see in the future.

Chair Pujo asked if a review of current zoning ordinance could be open for discussion.

Ms. Weiss responded by saying that the broader issues are currently being focused on at this time and that the Zoning Ordinance is a bit too specific at this point. However, that is not to say that it will not be reviewed at a later time.

Public Comment (2:14)

Kellam De Forrest, a local resident, asked the Historic Landmarks Commission to get involved in the drafting of a historic preservation element.

C-O Zone

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 529 W JUNIPERO ST

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-090-031

Application Number: MST2007-00419

Owner: Cancer Center of Santa Barbara

Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis LLP

Applicant: Shelley Bookspan

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story house and garage.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan.)

Present: Shelley Bookspan, Historian

<u>Staff comment:</u> Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the house is not historically significant because of its deteriorated condition.

Motion: Accept the report with the condition that a commemorative plaque be designed and installed on the site after being approved by the HLC.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent) Motion carried.

Second

Motion: Remove 529 W. Junipero Street from the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Sharp/Naylor: 7/0/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

2. 713 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone

(2:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-007

Application Number: MST2007-00436

Owner: Santa Barbara Historical Society

Architect: Edwards-Pitman

(This parcel contains two City Landmarks: "Historic Adobe (1825) and Covarrubias Adobe (1830)."This is a courtesy review of a proposal for a pair of new 16'-0" tall wrought iron gates to be installed at the Santa Barbara Street driveway entry. The gates will match existing entry gates to the parking lot of the Santa Barbara Historical Society.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO AN HISTORIC LANDMARK. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Present: Tom Beaudette, Consulting Engineers, Inc.

Public comment opened at 2:28 P.M.

Kellam De Forrest, a local resident, feels that, due to the historic nature of the adobes, a wooden gate would be more appropriate for this site .

Public comment closed at 2:30 P.M.

Straw Votes: How many of the Commissioners feel that the gate should be made of wood? 5/2/0.

(Hausz/LaVoie absent)

How many of the Commissioners feel the gate should be made out of iron?

2/5/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent)

Motion: Preliminary approval of the iron gates proposed and continued 2 weeks to consent

for final approval. The following Historic Resource findings were made: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource and the following findings for alterations to an Historic Landmark were made: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the

preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Murray/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 1535 SANTA BARBARA ST R-3 Zone

(2:38) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-005

Application Number: MST2007-00266 Landscape Architect: Robert Fowler

Owner: The Unitarian Society of Santa Barbara

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Unitarian Church." Proposal for a partial interior remodel of three existing buildings; accessibility and upgrading of architectural finishes; replacement of 11 windows in the Parish Hall; enclosing the 310 square foot loggia on the east side of the Parish Hall; adding a new terrace with new 678 square foot storage room below; and landscape and hardscape improvements in the Jefferson Hall Courtyard. Also proposed is to install new windows at classroom B, the Blake Building, and a new 15-space parking lot.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Peikert Group Architects

Rob Fowler, Peikert Group Architects April Palencia, Peikert Group Architects

Motion: Preliminary approval as submitted and indefinitely continued to Full Board for

final approval.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

4. 517 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(3:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007 Application Number: MST2005-00088 Applicant: H & R Investments

Owner: Montecito Bank & Trust Trustee (For Applicant: Peikert Group Architects

LLC)

The Proposed Project Consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development with six two-bedroom residential condominium units totaling 9,999 square feet (net) and two commercial condominium spaces totaling 2,872 square feet (net). One of the units would be affordable. A modification to allow the 10% open space on the second floor is requested. Seventeen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 030-06.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Peikert Group Architects

Scott Hopkins, Peikert Group Architects

Public comment opened at 3:13 P.M.

Karen McFadden, local resident, opposes the project Tony Vasallo, local resident, supports the project Kellam De Forrest, local resident, opposes the project

Public comment closed at 3:22 P.M.

Straw Votes

How many Commissioners feel that the essence, (mass, bulk, and scale), of the project is approvable with changes to certain architectural elements such as the tower and the south elevation? 4/2 (Murray and Sharpe opposed.)

How many Commissioners feel that this project is unacceptable in mass, bulk, and scale in its current configuration? 3/4

How many Commissioners feel the Chapala elevation has been improved from the previous presentation and is approaching an approvable stage? 2/5

How many Commissioners support the shape of the tower? 4/3

How many Commissioners support a reduction of the Brinkerhoff elevation, (the lowering of the top plate and the elimination of the gable and roof line)? 3/0/1 (Naylor abstained)

Motion: Preliminary approval and indefinite continuance In-Progress review with revisions

to the fenestration of the top level of the tower, provide articulation of the blank wall along the rear building through use of windows, landscaping, or other means, provide different sketches to simplify the design of the west elevation, and, to use a more Mediterranean plant pallette with taller trees as the landscape plan is

developed.

Action: Adams/Curtis, 3/4/2. (Boucher, Murray, Sharpe, Naylor opposed. Hausz/LaVoie

absent). Motion failed.

Second

Motion: Preliminary approval to indefinite continuance to In-Progress with revisions to the

fenestration of the top level of the tower, provide articulation of the blank wall along the rear building through the use of windows, landscaping, or other means, provide different sketches to simplify the design of the west elevation, use a more Mediterranean plant pallette with taller trees as the landscape plan is developed,

revisit the Chapala Street elevation, particularly looking at the tower.

Action: Naylor / Curtis, 4/3/2. (Boucher, Murray, Sharpe opposed. Hausz/LaVoie absent) Motion

carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 904 CAMINO VIEJO RD A-2 Zone

(4:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-060-048

Application Number: MST2007-00233

Owner: Christine Garvey
Applicant: Peter Becker

(This structure was deemed to be eligible for Structure of Merit status. Proposal to convert an existing 529 square foot detached two-car garage to a 500 square foot detached accessory building. The garage was previously proposed to be demolished under approved application MST2007-00077. The proposal also includes retaining an existing 917 square foot lath house which was previously proposed to be reduced to 417 square feet. A zoning modification is required to allow the detached accessory space to exceed 500 square feet. The proposal will result in a floor-to-lot-area ratio of .02.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 070-07.)

Present: Peter Becker

Motion: Preliminary approval and continued to Consent in two weeks for final approval.

Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Findings were made as follows: Neighborhood Preservation criteria have been met in accordance with Section

22.69.050 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0. (Hausz/LaVoie absent) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

6. 0-800 E CABRILLO BLVD

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(4:18)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-0RW
Application Number: MST2004-00806
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Marck Aguilar,

Agent: Marck Aguilar, Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Demolish, remove, and replace existing concrete sidewalk on beachside of Cabrillo Boulevard between State Street and Milpas Street. Landscape enhancements and pedestrian amenities to be included where appropriate. Sidewalk footprint from street curb to edge of part to remain unchanged.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Marck Aguilar, City Redevelopment Specialist

Nancy Rapp, Parks & Recreation Director

Bob Cunningham, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 4:24 P.M.

Susan Smith, a local artist in the craft show, supports the project.

Laurie Lehman, a member of the arts and craft show, as well as a member of the community, supports the project with certain reservations.

Kevin Healy, a member of arts and craft show, supports the project with certain reservations.

Deborah Healy, chair person for the Santa Barbara Arts and Craft Show Advisory Board community and representing the consensus of 200 members of the show, supports the project with certain reservations.

Marilyn Loperfido, advisory committee member, read a letters on behalf of Randi Hillard and Eileen Garrett, who are handicapped and oppose the project.

John La Pointe, a member of the arts and craft show, opposes the project.

Marilyn Loperfido, advisory committee member, opposes the project but would like to see improvements to the area.

Kellam De Forrest, local resident, supports the project.

Public comment closed at 4:51 P.M.

Motion: Final approval and indefinitely continued to Consent to review a plan on establishment of the landscaping and adjustments as outlined in the proposal summary.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 5/0/2 (Curtis/Murray abstained. La Voie /Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

7. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(5:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019

Application Number: MST2004-00005 Business Name: Granada Theatre

Owner: Santa Barbara Center For Performing Arts Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources "Granada theatre and offices." the proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Continued Review After Final of marquee design.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04.)

Present: Fernando Duarte, Duarte Designs

Steve Metsch, Architect

Monisha Adnani, Project Manager

Motion: Final approval with the condition that the applicant returns in 18 months to

determine whether a more energy efficient lighting source is available.

Action: Naylor/Murray, 7/0/0. (La Voie /Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

NEW ITEM

A. 223 E FIGUEROA ST C R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-018 Application Number: MST2007-00405 Owner: Paul Kontos

(Proposed 160 square foot bedroom addition and 58 square foot front porch addition and alterations to an existing 393 square foot, one-story, single- family residence. Proposed alterations include new exterior siding, roof, gutters, doors, windows, decorative dormer, and rebuilt back porch.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Final approval as submitted with all new materials to match existing.

NEW ITEM

B. 127 W CANON PERDIDO ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-002
Application Number: MST2007-00441
Owner: Nshe Lakeport, LLC
Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(Proposal to remodel the entire rear facade of a commercial building, provide access to a previously-approved second floor tower room, stripe the rear parking lot, and add a trash enclosure.)

Continued two weeks for applicant to provide a landscaping plan and other improvements as appropriate.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 1017 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-019
Application Number: MST2007-00390
Owner: Victor and Sus Schaff

Business Name: Outfit

(Proposal to permit an as-built wooden planter cover on an existing storefront.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Project withdrawn. Applicant will restore the planters to the previous condition and plant flowers or other flora in the planters.

FINAL REVIEW

D. 636 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-001
Application Number: MST2007-00257
Owner: Gallina Family Trust
Architect: Kenneth Gruskin
Applicant: Derrick Prudigalidad
Business Name: Verizon Wireless

(Proposal for exterior alterations of the streetscape facade including changes to finishes, doors, and windows. Proposed new signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Continued two weeks.

NEW ITEM

E. 533 BRINKERHOFF AVE C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-162-001 Application Number: MST2007-00451

Owner: Robert A. and Wanda E. Livernois

Contractor: Tower Roofing Inc

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Cook-Frisius Residence." Proposal to remove wood roofing shingles and apply Certainteed Landmark TL composition shingles in "Shenandoah" color.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCES FINDINGS.)

Final approval of Oakridge Pro Shingles in "Teak." The following Historic Resource findings were made.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

F. 500 NINOS DR P-R/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-002
Application Number: MST2003-00032
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Blackbird Architects

Agent: Tynan Group

Business Name: Santa Barbara Zoological Gardens

(Proposal for a California Condor exhibit and holding area consisting of a woven mesh enclosure, rock elements, renovation of an existing water feature and eagle holding area at the Santa Barbara Zoological Gardens.)

(Review After Final of proposed renovations to tortoise exhibit adjacent to condor exhibit.)

Final approval as submitted.

** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:31 P.M. **